

MINUTES
Marine Protected Areas Federal Advisory Committee Meeting
September 12, 2011
Meeting via WebEx and Conference Call

The meeting convened at 2:04 pm EST.

Meeting was called to order by Acting Designated Federal Official Lauren Wenzel and opened by Committee Chair, Eugenio Piñeiro-Soler. MPA Center Staff Member Denise Ellis-Hibbett took the roll call and established that there was a quorum present. The Chair reviewed the agenda, and noted that the purpose of the meeting was for the Committee to act on the Coastal and Marine Spatial Planning (CMSP) white paper that had been discussed at two previous conference calls in August 2011. The Chair commented that, while the Committee aims for consensus in its recommendations, a vote would be taken if necessary.

CMSP Subcommittee Chair Russell Moll updated the Committee on changes made to the white paper, based on discussions at the August 23 conference call. He noted that the CMSP writing team carefully considered all the comments, and took a “precautionary approach” to changes to the document, seeking not to make changes that might jeopardize the careful balance in the document that has resulted in broad support among many Committee members. Comments were received from Melissa Miller-Henson, Sarah Robinson, Gary Kania and Dave Wallace.

The Chair then called for questions or clarifications about the final proposed changes to the document. Edits were made to note that scientific studies may reduce conflict when selecting sites (but that conflict may still occur), and that these studies encompass both natural and social science.

Recognizing that Gary Kania and Dave Wallace had expressed concerns about the document on the previous conference call, Brian Melzian asked if they were more comfortable with the revised draft. Both replied that they continued to have reservations about the document. Dave Wallace expressed concern that the role of Regional Fishery Management Councils (RFMCs) was not sufficiently recognized in the paper, and general concerns about potential future designations of MPAs through the CMSP process. Gary Kania expressed concerns about the overall tone of the document being overly focused on protection vs. sustainable use. John Frampton noted similar concerns. At the request of a member, Lauren Wenzel offered to share Dave and Gary’s written comments with the full Committee. Sarah Robinson said that she did not read the paper as sanctioning changes in current law with respect to the role of RFMCs. Jesus Ruiz noted that National Marine Sanctuaries in California do not exclude fishing, and that the purpose of the paper was to raise awareness of MPAs and the National System of MPAs within the CMSP process.

The Chair called for a motion. Michelle Ridgway motioned to approve the paper as amended. Victor Mastone seconded the motion.

Denise Ellis-Hibbett called the roll for a vote. The paper was approved by a majority vote of 20 to three. Gary Kania, Dave Wallace and John Frampton voted against adoption.

Lauren Wenzel said that the Chair would transmit the final paper to the Under Secretary of Commerce Jane Lubchenco and to the Deputy Assistant Secretary for DOI Eileen Sobeck. The letter would also include a request that the paper be shared with other agencies that are members of the National Ocean Council. There was a brief discussion of how the vote should be characterized in the cover letter, and it was decided that the letter would note that it was passed by a majority vote, but would not include other details.

Lauren Wenzel congratulated the CMSP Subcommittee for their hard work, and noted that the November meeting would be shortened to two days, since this work has been completed. Eugenio Piñero-Soler also congratulated the CMSP Subcommittee, and thanked all the Committee members for their contributions and deliberation.

The Committee adjourned at 3:00pm EST.

Committee members present:

Mr. Eugenio Piñero-Soler, Chair
Ms. Lori Arguelles, Vice Chair
Dr. Russ Moll, CMSP Subcommittee, Chair
Mr. David Blazer, CMSP Subcommittee, Vice Chair
Dr. Pricilla Brooks, CMSP Subcommittee, Writing Team
Ms. Karen Garrison, CMSP Subcommittee, Writing Team
Mr. Bruce A. Tackett, CMSP Subcommittee, Writing Team
Mr. Joe Schumacker*, CMSP Subcommittee, Writing Team
Mr. John E. Frampton
Mr. Rick Gaffney
Mr. George Geiger
Mr. Gary Kania
Mr. Victor Mastone*
Ms. Melissa Miller-Henson
Mr. Alvin Osterback
Dr. Hans Radtke
Capt. Phillip Renaud
Ms. Michelle Ridgway
Dr. Sarah Robinson
Mr. Jesús Ruiz*
Dr. Della Scott-Ireton *
Mr. David H. Wallace
Mr. Robert Wargo

*Also a member of the Cultural Heritage Resources Workgroup.

Ex Officio Federal Representatives and Other Federal Staff present:

Mr. Steven Jameson, NOAA, Program Planning and Integration
Dr. Brian Melzian, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Mr. Bret Wolfe, US Fish and Wildlife Service
Ms. Heather Sagar, National Marine Fisheries Service
Mr. Steven Tucker, US Coast Guard

NOAA National Marine Protected Areas Center staff:

Ms. Lauren Wenzel, Acting Director/Acting Designated Federal Official

Dr. Valerie Grussing, Cultural Resources Coordinator

Ms. Julia Townsend, CMSP Subcommittee Staff, Program Analyst

Dr. Robert Brock, Marine Biologist

Ms. Denise Ellis-Hibbett, Knauss Sea Grant Fellow